

การประเมินผลโครงการพัฒนาชนบทแบบผสมผสาน ระยะที่ 2 แขวงบอลิคำไซ สาธารณรัฐประชาธิปไตยประชาชนลาว

An Evaluation of the Integrated Rural Development Project, Phase II, Bolikhamxai Province, LAO PDR*

สมศักดิ์ ศรีสันติสุข (Somsak Srisontisuk)**

บทคัดย่อ

การประเมินผลครั้งนี้มีวัตถุประสงค์ คือ เพื่อประเมิน (1) ความเหมาะสมและผลกระทบของกิจกรรมโครงการ (2) ระบบการจัดการโครงการและการติดต่อสื่อสารกับหน่วยงานที่เกี่ยวข้อง (3) ความสำเร็จของแผนงานโครงการ (4) การได้รับประโยชน์ของโครงการ (5) ความยั่งยืนของโครงการ และ (6) ข้อเสนอแนะสำหรับนำไปประยุกต์ใช้ในโครงการระยะที่ 3 ระเบียบวิธีการวิจัยได้ใช้การอภิปรายกลุ่มใน 18 หมู่บ้าน การสัมภาษณ์เจ้าหน้าที่ในระดับแขวงและเมือง การสังเกตการณ์เกี่ยวกับกิจกรรมโครงการ และตรวจสอบข้อมูลที่ได้เก็บรวบรวมมาแล้วจากเจ้าหน้าที่ของสหพันธ์แม่หญิงลาว และองค์การช่วยเหลือเด็กออสเตรเลีย ผลการประเมินผลพบว่า (1) กิจกรรมต่าง ๆ ที่ได้เลือกนั้นมีความยืดหยุ่นและเหมาะสมต่อสภาพการณ์และความต้องการของหมู่บ้าน (2) ทั้งระบบการจัดการโครงการและการติดต่อสื่อสารกับหน่วยงานที่เกี่ยวข้องมีประสิทธิภาพและประสิทธิผล (3) กิจกรรมส่วนใหญ่ประสบความสำเร็จในการเพิ่มรายได้และการออม (4) การช่วยเหลือต่อการได้รับผลประโยชน์ของโครงการ เช่น สตรีชนบท คนยากจน ชนชาติพันธุ์กลุ่มน้อย และเด็ก ได้รับการช่วยเหลือตามเป้าหมายของโครงการ (5) ความยั่งยืนจากผลกระทบของโครงการควรจะต้องมีการติดตามอย่างเป็นระบบ และ (6) ข้อเสนอแนะ คือ ควรปรับปรุงทักษะการจัดการในระดับหมู่บ้าน และการสนับสนุนทักษะการจัดการของสหพันธ์แม่หญิงลาว ในระดับแขวงและเมืองในเรื่องความรู้และการปฏิบัติงานอย่างเป็นระบบ

Abstract

The objectives of the evaluation were to assess (1) suitability and impact of project activities; (2) project management systems and communication with line departments; (3) achievement of the project's planned outputs; (4) gain of project beneficiaries; (5) project sustainability; and (6) recommendation for use in a third phase of the project. Research methodology included focus group discussions in 18 villages, interviews with provincial and district level officials, observations of project activities, and review of data previously collected by Lao Women's Union (LWU) and Save the Children Australia project staff. The results of the evaluation are as follows : (1) The activities of the project chose were feasible and appropriate to the situation and needs of villages. (2) Both the project management system and communication

*The evaluation was implemented by the Lao Women's Union, Save the Children Australia with funding from Save the Children Australia and Bread for the World.

**Associate Professor, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences,

with line departments are relatively efficient and effective. (3) Most of the activities are successful in terms of increasing incomes and savings. (4) Assistance to project beneficiaries, namely rural women, the poor, ethnic minorities and children has been provided at the project's target level. (5) The sustainability of the project's impacts should be monitored more systematically. And finally (6) the major recommendations are to improve managerial skills at the village level, and support the managerial skills of the LWU at the provincial and district level, in terms of knowledge and systematic practice.

คำสำคัญ : การประเมินผล การจัดการ การพัฒนาชนบท

Keywords : evaluation ; management ; beneficiaries and sustainability

Introduction

Lao PDR is one of the poorest countries in South East Asia, with a per capita income of around USD 330. Much of the population, particularly in rural areas, operates largely outside the monetary system. There is great ethnic, cultural, and linguistic diversity, as well as economic disparity between the lowland Lao Loum, the highland Lao Theung and mountain dwelling Lao Soung. The situation for women also varies between groups, but the socio-economic well being and social position of rural women and their children are low among all groups.

Save the Children Australia (SCA) together with the Lao Women's Union (LWU) has just completed Phase II of an Integrated Rural Development project in four districts of Bolikhamxai Province (Save the Children Australia, January-June, 1996; July-December 1996 ; and January-June 1997). The project's objectives were to improve the quality of rural women's life; assist ethnic minority communities to increase their food security; support improvements in rural women's health status; decrease the burden of rural women's labour; provide means for rural women to increase their families' incomes and savings; strengthen rural women's skills and capabilities to participate in village development; and build and strengthen the technical, managerial and training skills, knowledge, and capabilities of LWU personnel, sectoral counterparts, and villagers.

At the beginning of 1989 SCA project staff planned a comprehensive evaluation of the project,

for collecting information to answer these questions, as well as for an external consultant. LWU partners made suggestions for improving the tables. The findings of this evaluation will be used to plan a phase III of the project.

Evaluation Objectives

The objectives of this evaluation are to :

- Assess whether the project activities chosen were feasible and appropriate to the villagers' situation and needs;
- Assess how effective and efficient were the project's management systems, and communication with line departments;
- Assess to what extent the project's planned outputs have been achieved;
- Evaluate the impact of project activities on project beneficiaries;
- Assess whether the project's impacts are sustainable; and
- Make recommendations for a Phase III Integrated Village Development Project.

Research Methodology

1. Target villages

A total of 18 villages out of the 106 project villages (17%) were studied. The average number of households-per-village in the four project districts is 106, with the average number of households-per-village being greatest in Pakkading at 170, followed by 89 in Thaphabat, 88 in Khamkeut, and 77 in Parksane. The villages

Thaphabat District

Houai Leuk Villag

Hatkhai Village

Veunthat Village

Parksane District

Non Oudom Village

Sen Oudom Village

Parkadon Village

Hangsing Village

Nong Gnong Village

Pakkading District

Pakkading Tai Village

Houaipheth Village

Namthone Village

Sensamlan Village

Khamkeut District

Dongbang Village

Phontan Village

Poungphan Village

Na Pae Village

Nong Or Tai Village

Nong Or Neua Village

2. Research methods used

- Reviewed and analysed the documentation available in SCA files for the selected villages in each district;
- Met with provincial and district level officials and discussed their performance in the project;
- Met with the LWU Project Management Team (PMT) and line department officials at provincial and district level;
- Met the villagers, and used focus group discussion as a participatory evaluation research tool;
- Made field observations of the project's activities; and
- Organized a one day seminar to get feedback on the above findings from provincial and district level LWU staff, line departments and administrators, and concerned SCA and central LWU personnel.

3. **Research period** : 8-28 October, 1997

4. **Data analysis** : Both quantitative data, collected by the PMT and SCA, and qualitative

were analysed in this study. (Casely and Kumar, 1987)

5. Limitations : The findings of this evaluation research were not compared to any baseline data, since there was no formal evaluation at the end of Phase I. In addition, the evaluator had no first-hand knowledge one way or the other concerning the quality of the data collected by SCA and the PMT.

Conclusion

Evaluation research reveals the following about the Integrated Village Development project.

Activities

The project activities chosen were feasible and appropriate to the situation and needs of villagers. Implementing activities have not proved difficult in any district. Needs assessments have been based on villagers' needs. Resources have been adequate to carry out the project plan, and almost all of the activities in the Project Implementation Document (PID) have been carried out. Most of the activities have been successful in terms of increasing incomes and savings.

There are a few activities which can be considered either inappropriate or inefficient in resource use in terms of the limited transportation and under-developed infrastructure in some parts of the project area, and a few activities have had to be re-scheduled in order to meet the needs of villagers. One constraints has been the lack of technical knowledge and specialists--especially for the gravity fed water supply-at the provincial and village level.

Management system and communication with line departments

The LWU PMT has worked efficiently and effectively in both phase I and II. At the village level, there are many indications that LWU activities are improving the quality of life.

The project's management system and

effective and efficient at a minimum level. The PMT at the provincial and district levels have implemented activities according to the PID plan. Communication between the LWU and the line departments has been adequate for effective and efficient planning and implementation of activities, and there is political support for the project.

Project Outputs

Overall, the project's planned outputs have been achieved at a basic level: Rural women in project villages have been provided opportunities

ties to increase their families' incomes and savings, and there has been adoption of project-introduced practices by other people in the same villages. However, the level of achievement is still not high enough to ensure long term sustainable improvements in villagers' quality of life. Family incomes and savings are gradually increasing and the quantity of the activities seems to be increasing, but the quality of activities needs to be improved. Field observation indicates that the activities in villages near the road are more successful than in those villages far from the road, part of the reason being, of course, that villages near the road have easier access to many of the resources needed for community development.

Project beneficiaries

The project's main beneficiaries are rural women, the poor, ethnic minorities and children. Project activities have targeted, and benefited women, and have helped them to increase both their incomes and their savings. The weaving and small animal raising activities have also benefited children by making it possible for their families to increase their food, and to earn some money with which to improve their quality of life. The project also works to promote women at the provincial, district and village level to work in community development. The project has had other beneficiaries as well. LWU management, through its work on the project, has improved its ability to plan, organise, communicate with line departments, and implement. Line department officials

Project Sustainability

The sustainability of the project's impacts should be monitored more systematically. Various inputs are needed by the project, both immediate and longer term, in order to maintain the gains made, ensure sustainability, and extend project activities. For example the LWU's efforts to manage the project are constrained by their lack of transportation for village visits, the lack of guidelines or forms for planning, implementing, monitoring and evaluating activities, and the general lack of education among their village level members. Additional training is needed in order to strengthen the technical knowledge of line departments, and additional project management skills are needed at the village level.

Recommendations for Phase III.

Retain

- Maintain and extend revolving funds.
- Continue LWU monitoring of project management at the provincial and district level.
- Maintain the present project districts as the focus of continuing project activities, as the project has not yet fulfilled the needs of the villagers there, especially the poorest.
- Continue activities at least 3 years, to allow them time to consolidate and ensure sustainability. This is particularly for the revolving funds.

Change

- Amend village selection guidelines to allow for more than 70 households.
- Select the activities for a village according to what is feasible in terms of that village's structure.
- Consider gradually converting the existing revolving loan funds to a village bank system, managed by the villagers. After each revolving fund is finished in the village, it could become a village bank, with interest charged for loans. Then the revolving funds could move to other villages. This would be a village bank for community development. That is, the villagers could use or borrow money to implement com-

Strengthen

● Provide more budget, both for more of the same activities and for additional activities. Increase the budget for each activities according to the inflation rate.

● Provide project management training to strengthen LWU at the provincial, district, and village level. These skills must be improved before the SCA withdraws from the villages.

● Provide technical training for line department personnel.

● Consider as a geographic focus the Khamkeut District, which largely comprises ethnic minorities. Other ethnic minority areas might be considered as well. These people still have a low standard of living.

● Focus on villages that have no access to a town in the wet season.

● Select some active villages to be models of each activity, use these model villages to transfer technology and knowledge to other villages.

References

- Caseley, Dennis J. and Kumar, Krishna. 1987. **Project Monitoring and Evaluation in Agriculture**. London : Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Save the Children Australia. 1996. **Integrated Village Development Project Phase II**. Bolikhamxai Province, Lao PDR, January-June report.
- . 1996. **Integrated Village Development Project Phase II**. Bolokhamxai Province, Lao PDR, July-December report.
- . 1997. **Integrated Village Development Project Phase II**. Bolokhamxai Province, Lao PDR, January-June report.